



Civil Society Contributions to OSCE-ODIHR annual reports:

Hate Crimes in the OSCE Region – incidents and responses

HCR 2014 Observatorio para la libertad religiosa y de conciencia (*Spanish observatory of freedom of religion and conscience*)

1 April 2015



(You will burn like in '36 –start date of the Spanish Civil War-, common graffiti written on church walls in Spain)

María García (olreligiosa@libertadreligiosa.es)

President of the *Observatorio para la Libertad Religiosa y de Conciencia*

Nicolás Zambrana-Tévar PhD LLM (nicolaszambrantevar@hotmail.com)

Lecturer at the Kazakhstan Institute of Management (KIMEP)

Introduction and context

This report is based upon a more extensive and thorough analysis of attacks against religious freedom in Spain, which has been drafted in Spanish by the *Observatorio para la libertad religiosa y de conciencia* (Spanish observatory for freedom of religion and conscience; <http://libertadreligiosa.es/>).

In order to properly understand the reasons behind the attacks made on Christians and the Christian Churches in Spain, during the past year, it is necessary to devote a few lines to the legal framework of religious freedom in the aforementioned country, as well as to its specific political situation.

The Spanish Constitution protects freedom of religion in its art. 16, along with freedom of thought, which is granted the same importance. According to said paragraph, freedom of religion belongs not only to individuals but also to communities and its only limits are respect for public order. Spain is also a signatory of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, whose article 18 protects freedom of thought, conscience and religion.

The Spanish Constitution also declares that Spain is a Social and Democratic State (art. 1.1), subject to the rule of law. The fact that it mentions Spain as a Social State has been understood by most scholars as an indication to the State and its Public Administration, given by the Constitution itself, to make itself present in society, in order to guarantee all the freedoms and constitutional rights granted by this supreme norm. This means that, even if the right to adequate housing (art. 47 CE) cannot be protected by ordinary courts, the State is enabled to engage in economic policies aimed at providing housing for everyone.

As far as freedom of religion is concerned, the fact that Spain is a social State also means that the Spanish State and the Spanish Government are not supposed to simply allow citizens to practise their religion freely but is also enabled to and has the duty to provide individuals and communities with the means to enjoy that right. For instance: art. 27.3 of the Constitution shows that the Government must guarantee the right that parents have to ensure that their children receive the religious and moral education that is in accordance with their own beliefs. This right has been protected specifically by means of the Accords signed between the Holy See and the Spanish Government in 1977, whereby children must be able to have courses on Catholic religious teaching in State schools (protestant, muslim and jewish children enjoy the same right, through parallel accords). Nevertheless, this constitutional right is being harshly contested by most Spanish parties and some are even announcing that they will abolish these Accords when they have the chance. For instance, courses of religious teachings are discriminated because their grades are purposeless towards the children's overall school grades. Furthermore, a great number of Spanish children attend subsidized

religious schools under the umbrella of the “Social State” obligation. Still, some regional Governments continuously refuse to grant any subsidies to these schools.

There are several reasons why 2014 has been a very worrying year for freedom of religion in Spain, especially for Christians. In the first place, the Government announced in 2013 that it may introduce a new abortion law which may be more restrictive than the 2009 law but much more permissive than the abortion law introduced by the Socialist government in 1985. Still, the Socialist party, and many other parties and civil society organisations, have criticised the Church very rudely (and even violently) because, with no evidence at all, they believe that the Catholic Church is behind this intended reform, although the Minister of Justice (Alberto Ruiz-Gallardón) the one who has in fact tried to introduce this new law, in accordance with his party’s electoral promises, is known not to be on very good terms with the hierarchy of the Church.

There are other signs that make 2014 a difficult year for the Spanish Catholic Church and for Catholics in general. Practically every month, harsh accusations have been made on bishops or on the Church as a whole and requests have been made to abolish the Accords with the Holy See which guarantee the teaching of religion at school for those who wish to, while at the same time many difficulties are being introduced to the teaching of religion, but claiming that the International Accords are nevertheless being respected.

Furthermore, the Catholic Church, like many other private and public institutions and charities, is exempted from taxes levied on real estate but many politicians, every month, have denounced this so called “privilege” with very harsh and rude arguments. Other false and unbelievable accusations against the Church, which may be behind the violent episodes which are about to be described, are the accusation of being behind a new reform of the education law which, nevertheless, does not introduce any advantages to the teaching of religion in schools.

Crime type

- 1- Homicide
- 2- Physical violence
- 3- Damage to property
- 4- Vandalism
- 5- Desecration of graves
- 6- Attacks against places of worship
- 7- Threats/threatening behaviour
- 8- Other crimes can also be included and described (hate incidents)

Bias indicators

- 1- Victim/Witness Perception
- 2- Comments, Written Statements, Gestures, and Graffiti
- 3- Racial, Ethnic, Gender, and Cultural Differences
- 4- Organized Hate Groups
- 5- Previous Bias Crimes/Incidents
- 6- Location indicates bias

Attacks against places of worship

Chart 1

Incident	Physical and psychological pressure on members of a parish to stop the construction of a cemetery
Date, time, location	From March 2014 onwards, Madrid
Country	Spain
Source of information	http://infocatolica.com/blog/cartadirector.php/1409280853-contra-el-acoso-a-santa-catal#more26608
Victim(s) involved (number / name)	Members of parish of Santa Catalina
Crime type	3- Damage to property 4- Vandalism 6- Attacks against places of worship
Perpetrator(s) (if known)	Association “No al Cementerio” (No to the cemetery) and “Vecinos de Opañel” (Neighbors of Opañel)
Brief description of incident with bias indicators	Building materials belonging to the Parish were stolen and damaged. Parishioners were repeatedly insulted and harassed on the street. Insulting graffiti were written on the walls of the Parish.
Bias indicators	1- Victim perception 6- Location indicates bias
Status of the case	
Response of local authorities	

Impact on the victim(s) and the community	
---	--

Chart 2

Incident	Multiple damages occasioned to religious symbols in the cemetery of Brunete (Madrid)
Date, time, location	30 March 2014. Brunete (Madrid)
Country	Spain
Source of information	http://www.abc.es/madrid/20140331/abci-profanacion-cementerio-brunete-201403311805.html
Victim(s) involved (number / name)	Catholics in general
Crime type	3- Damage to property 5- Desecration of graves 6- Attacks against places of worship
Perpetrator(s) (if known)	Unknown
Brief description of incident with bias indicators	The cemetery of Brunete (Madrid) was vandalized during the night of 30 March, 2014. Tombs, niches, crucifixes and other religious symbols were either destroyed or damaged. A graffiti was found, which said: <i>“PP (the Conservative Party) is a son of a bitch”</i>
Bias indicators	2- Comments: the Spanish Conservative Party is considered by some to be associated with christians 6- Location indicates bias
Status of the case	
Response of local authorities	Several political parties in the municipality have condemned the events
Impact on the victim(s) and the community	

Chart 3

Incident	Removal of and damages caused to an image of Jesus Christ
Date, time, location	9 May, 2014 San Sadurniño (Galicia)
Country	Spain
Source of information	http://www.hazteoir.org/noticia/60559-bng-expulsa-al-sagrado-corazon-jesus-san-sadurnino-coruna
Victim(s) involved (number / name)	Catholics in general
Crime type	6- Attacks against places of worship
Perpetrator(s) (if known)	The Municipality of San Sadurniño (Galicia)
Brief description of incident with bias indicators	The Municipality of San Sadurniño (Galicia) removed an old image of Jesus Christ which was in the town and exhibited it broken in half later on.
Bias indicators	6- Location indicates bias
Status of the case	
Response of local authorities	
Impact on the victim(s) and the community	

Chart 4

Incident	Sacrilegious pictures taken in a church
Date, time, location	June 2014, Bilbao
Country	Spain
Source of information	http://www.periodistadigital.com/religion/diocesis/2014/06/10/el-obispado-de-bilbao-considera-sacrilegas-las-fotos-de-una-mujer-desnuda-en-el-altar-de-una-iglesia.shtml

Victim(s) involved (number / name)	Catholics in general
Crime type	6- Attacks against places of worship
Perpetrator(s) (if known)	José Ángel Uberguaga (photographer)
Brief description of incident with bias indicators	A photographer and a model entered into a church and pictures of her naked on top of the altar were taken and published in a website
Bias indicators	1- Witness perception 6- Location indicates bias
Status of the case	
Response of local authorities	
Impact on the victim(s) and the community	

Chart 5

Incident	Robbery of sacred objects in a church and desecration of the tabernacle and Hosts
Date, time, location	7 July 2014, Belicena (Granada)
Country	Spain
Source of information	http://www.ideal.es/granada/provincia-granada/201407/07/roban-objetos-sagrados-iglesia-20140707090643.html
Victim(s) involved (number / name)	The Catholic people
Crime type	2- Physical violence 3- Damage to property 4- Vandalism 6- Attacks against places of worship
Perpetrator(s) (if known)	Unknown

known)	
Brief description of incident with bias indicators	Robbery of objects in a church which may have had economic purposes, but sacred hosts were also thrown to the ground.
Bias indicators	6- Location indicates bias
Status of the case	
Response of local authorities	
Impact on the victim(s) and the community	

Chart 6

Incident	Desecration of church
Date, time, location	31 August 2014, Quintanilla de Vivar (Burgos)
Country	Spain
Source of information	http://infocatolica.com/?t=noticia&cod=21841&utm_medium=twitter&utm_campaign=NoticiasTw&utm_source=infocatolicatw
Victim(s) involved (number / name)	Catholics in general
Crime type	2- Physical violence 3- Damage to property 4- Vandalism 6- Attacks against places of worship
Perpetrator(s) (if known)	Unknown
Brief description of incident with bias indicators	The door of the Church of St. Eulalia was destroyed, money and other objects were stolen, as well as the Sacred Hosts.
Bias indicators	6- Location indicates bias
Status of the case	

Response of local authorities	
Impact on the victim(s) and the community	

Chart 7

Incident	Church door is completely burnt
Date, time, location	6 October 2014, Málaga
Country	Spain
Source of information	http://infocatolica.com/?t=noticia&cod=22140&utm_medium=twitter&utm_campaign=NoticiasTw&utm_source=infocatolicatw
Victim(s) involved (number / name)	Catholics in general
Crime type	3- Damage to property 4- Vandalism 6- Attacks against places of worship
Perpetrator(s) (if known)	Unknown
Brief description of incident with bias indicators	The door of a church was burnt down by unknown people and the inside of the church was filled with smoke
Bias indicators	6- Location indicates bias
Status of the case	
Response of local authorities	
Impact on the victim(s) and the community	

Chart 8

Incident	Graffiti in cemetery
Date, time, location	20 November, 2014, Paracuellos del Jarama (Madrid)
Country	Spain
Source of information	http://infocatolica.com/?t=noticia&cod=22550&utm_medium=twitter&utm_campaign=NoticiasTw&utm_source=infocatolicatw
Victim(s) involved (number / name)	Catholics in general
Crime type	3- Damage to property 7- Threats/threatening behaviour
Perpetrator(s) (if known)	FEMEN
Brief description of incident with bias indicators	Barebreasted women entered into the cemetery shouting " <i>Stop canonizing fascism</i> ". The cemetery hosts many tombs from christians assassinated during the Spanish Civil War
Bias indicators	4- Organized Hate Groups 6- Location indicates bias
Status of the case	
Response of local authorities	
Impact on the victim(s) and the community	

Chart 9

Incident	Threats to religious school
Date, time, location	28 November 2014, Rivas Vaciamadrid (Madrid)
Country	Spain
Source of information	http://www.libertaddigital.com/fotos/amenazas-colegio-rivas-espana-1008947/ http://www.abc.es/madrid/20140826/abci-acoso-cristianos-rivas-201408251333.html

Victim(s) involved (number / name)	Parents of the school
Crime type	3- Damage to property 7- Threats/threatening behaviour
Perpetrator(s) (if known)	
Brief description of incident with bias indicators	Organised campaign against the building of a religious school, with many posters around the city and graffiti on the walls of the school saying: <i>"Religion out of school"</i> , <i>"Get your rosaries out of our ovaries"</i>
Bias indicators	4- Organized Hate Groups 6- Location indicates bias
Status of the case	
Response of local authorities	
Impact on the victim(s) and the community	

Chart 10

Incident	Religious image of the Virgin Mary is destroyed by fire
Date, time, location	4 December 2014, Palma del Río (Córdoba)
Country	Spain
Source of information	http://sevilla.abc.es/andalucia/cordoba/20141205/sevi-virgen-piedad-calcinada-201412051407.html
Victim(s) involved (number / name)	Catholics in general
Crime type	3- Damage to property 4- Vandalism 6- Attacks against places of worship
Perpetrator(s) (if known)	Unknown

Brief description of incident with bias indicators	A fire seriously damaged the old and valuable image of <i>La Virgen de la Piedad</i> . Everything leads to suspect that the fire was purposefully caused by an arsonist because nothing else in the Church was burnt
Bias indicators	1- Witness perception 6- Location indicates bias
Status of the case	
Response of local authorities	
Impact on the victim(s) and the community	The newspaper indicates that the image was very venerated by the local community, who are devastated

Anti-religious threats and insults

Chart 11

Incident	Storming into a church during the celebration of the Mass
Date, time, location	9 February 2014, Banyoles (Catalonia)
Country	Spain
Source of information	http://www.religionenlibertad.com/sin-impunidad-los-anticatolicos-que-asaltaron-la-misa-en-banyoles-con-36354.htm
Victim(s) involved (number / name)	Catholics attending the Mass on the day of the event
Crime type	7- Threatening behavior
Perpetrator(s) (if known)	Youth organization <i>Arran</i>
Brief description of incident with bias indicators	A group of people stormed into a church while the Mass was being celebrated, shouting and throwing leaflets. They also displayed a banner which said " <i>Remove the rosaries from our ovaries</i> "

Bias indicators	2- Comments and written statements made 6- Location indicates bias
Status of the case	
Response of local authorities	
Impact on the victim(s) and the community	

Chart 12

Incident	Storming into a church during the celebration of the Mass
Date, time, location	9 February 2014, Palma de Mallorca (Balearic Islands)
Country	Spain
Source of information	http://www.elmundo.es/baleares/2014/02/09/52f7cf14e2704ed4598b456b.html
Victim(s) involved (number / name)	Catholics attending the Mass on the day of the event
Crime type	7- Threatening behavior
Perpetrator(s) (if known)	Antipatriarcals Mallorca
Brief description of incident with bias indicators	A group of about 30 people stormed into a church while the Mass was being celebrated at the church of Sant Miquel, shouting in favor of abortion and throwing leaflets as well as displaying a banner which said <i>"Remove the rosaries from our ovaries"</i>
Bias indicators	2- Comments and written statements made 6- Location indicates bias
Status of the case	
Response of local authorities	
Impact on the victim(s) and the	

community	
-----------	--

Chart 13

Incident	Barebreasted activists chain themselves to a church altar
Date, time, location	13 June 2014, Madrid
Country	Spain
Source of information	http://www.libertaddigital.com/espana/2014-06-13/dos-feministas-se-encadenan-a-un-crucifijo-en-el-altar-de-la-almudena-1276521318/
Victim(s) involved (number / name)	Catholics in general
Crime type	2- Comments 7- Threats, threatening behavior
Perpetrator(s) (if known)	FEMEN
Brief description of incident with bias indicators	Two barebreasted activists of FEMEN chained themselves to the main altar of the Almudena Cathedral (Madrid). They had the message written on their chests: <i>freedom to have an abortion</i>
Bias indicators	2- Comments and written statements made 4- Organized hate groups 6- Location indicates bias
Status of the case	
Response of local authorities	
Impact on the victim(s) and the community	

Chart 14

Incident	Threats to a member of a Christian lawyers group
Date, time, location	26 June, 2014, Valladolid (Castilla y León)
Country	Spain

Source of information	https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ZUx3x3OSx5w https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=L6OuoVSUjIQ
Victim(s) involved (number / name)	Asociación de Abogados Cristianos
Crime type	2- Comments 7- Threats, threatening behavior
Perpetrator(s) (if known)	Don Pedro Niño, CGT (Confederación General de Trabajadores)
Brief description of incident with bias indicators	Don Pedro Niño and more people held a demonstration in front of the office of the <i>Asociación de Abogados Cristianos</i> (Christian Lawyers Association, C/Panaderos 39), during which a member of the association was threatened with physical violence.
Bias indicators	1- Victim/Witness Perception 2- Comments, Written Statements, Gestures, and Graffiti 4- Organized Hate Groups 5- Previous Bias Crimes/Incidents
Status of the case	
Response of local authorities	
Impact on the victim(s) and the community	

Chart 15

Incident	Offensive newspaper article against the Jewish people
Date, time, location	24 July 2014 Madrid
Country	Spain
Source of information	http://www.elmundo.es/opinion/2014/07/24/53d16623ca4741be538b4573.html
Victim(s) involved (number / name)	The Jewish people

Crime type	8- Other hate incidents
Perpetrator(s) (if known)	Antonio Gala (famous Spanish writer)
Brief description of incident with bias indicators	The famous Spanish writer Antonio Gala wrote an Op Ed entitled "The Chosen" in the nationwide newspaper El Mundo, where he complained about the damage that the Jewish People always do to its neighbors. The article contained expressions such as "No surprise they are so often expelled".
Bias indicators	1- Victim/Witness perception 2- Comments, Written Statements 3- Racial, Ethnic, Gender, and Cultural Differences
Status of the case	
Response of local authorities	
Impact on the victim(s) and the community	The Spanish Jewish community has sued Antonio Gala (author of the Op Ed)

Chart 16

Incident	Threats against bishop
Date, time, location	Madrid, 24 December 2014
Country	Spain
Source of information	http://www.20minutos.es/noticia/2313250/0/entrevista-los-chikos-del-maiz/la-estanquera-de-saigon/chikos-del-maiz-negatoni-el-sucio/ http://versosperfectos.com/canciones/los-chikos-del-maiz-a-d10s-le-pido
Victim(s) involved (number / name)	Antonio María Rouco Varela (bishop of Madrid, president of the Bishop's conference)
Crime type	7- Threats and threatening behavior

Perpetrator(s) (if known)	<i>Los chicos del maíz</i> (music group)
Brief description of incident with bias indicators	Los chicos del maíz has released a new disc, one of whose songs includes a verse which says: “ <i>A Rouco Varela, que lo violen y con condón</i> ” (Rouco Varela should be raped and with a condom).
Bias indicators	1- Victim/Witness perception 2- Comments
Status of the case	
Response of local authorities	
Impact on the victim(s) and the community	

Chart 17

Incident	Threats against churches in a work of art
Date, time, location	November 2014, Madrid
Country	Spain
Source of information	http://infocatolica.com/?t=noticia&cod=22344
Victim(s) involved (number / name)	Catholics in general
Crime type	7- Threats
Perpetrator(s) (if known)	<i>Mujeres públicas</i> (Argentinian feminist group).
Brief description of incident with bias indicators	The work of art entitled “ <i>Cajita de fósforos</i> ” (Matchbox) was exhibited in the Museo Nacional Centro de Arte Reina Sofía (main Spanish contemporary art museum). On the work of art it could be read “ <i>La única iglesia que ilumina es la que arde, ¡contribuye!</i> ” (“the only church that illuminates is a burning church, contribute!”, (famous quote by anarchist Kropotnik and Spanish anarchist and revolutionary Buenaventura Durruti). On the work of art a burning

	church could be seen.
Bias indicators	1- Victim/Witness perception 2- Comments
Status of the case	
Response of local authorities	
Impact on the victim(s) and the community	

Other relevant incidents

Chart 18

Incident	Computer attack against the web of the Archbishopric of Granada
Date, time, location	13 January 2014, Madrid
Country	Spain
Source of information	http://www.periodistadigital.com/religion/diocesis/2014/01/13/anonymous-hackea-la-pagina-web-del-arzobispado-de-granada-religion-iglesia-casate-se-sumisa.shtml
Victim(s) involved (number / name)	The Archbishopric of Granada
Crime type	4- Vandalism
Perpetrator(s) (if known)	A group called "Anonymous" claimed having done it
Brief description of incident with bias indicators	Hackers accessed the website of the Archbishopric of Granada and wrote offensive messages
Bias indicators	2- Comments and written statements made by perpetrators 6- Location indicates bias
Status of the case	

Response of local authorities	
Impact on the victim(s) and the community	

Chart

Incident	Computer attack against the web of the Archbishops of Madrid
Date, time, location	18 July 2014, Madrid
Country	Spain
Source of information	Víctor Hernández (Archbishops of Madrid)
Victim(s) involved (number / name)	Archbishops of Madrid
Crime type	4- Vandalism
Perpetrator(s) (if known)	Unknown
Brief description of incident with bias indicators	Hackers accessed the website of the Archbishops of Madrid and deleted all the files
Bias indicators	6- Location indicates bias
Status of the case	
Response of local authorities	
Impact on the victim(s) and the community	